

--FOR PEER REVIEW ONLY--

**Questions regarding the Weakfish Stock Assessment,  
for the  
Data Poor Working Group Review (12/08)**

**Abundance indices**

- Does strong correlation of recreational indices using various effort estimates justify use of simpler method?
- Please provide input on criteria for selecting and eliminating "final" tuning indices.

**Analytical methods**

- Should terminal year estimates be presented for management if catch at age modeling is known to produce a retrospective pattern? At what level of retrospective change would terminal year estimate be considered unreliable?
- Discuss merits and drawbacks of using re-scaled relative F and other methods to estimate F, biomass, and abundance in recent years (*i.e.* to eliminate retrospective pattern).

**Non-equilibrium**

- Analyses explored discrepancies between surveys, landings, and anecdotal info indicated factors other than F might be driving the population. Provide insight on analyses that allow judgment of the likelihood that equilibrium or non-equilibrium assumptions are being met?
- Is there sufficient evidence to support the conclusion of increasing natural mortality? Please provide suggestions for methods to evaluate the assumption of constant M.
- Please provide input on incorporating ecosystem (*e.g.* predation) losses into an age-structured model.

**General**

- Suggestions to strengthen assessment (research, analyses, methods).